

**CITY OF MINNEAPOLIS
CPED – PLANNING DIVISION
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: 401 8th Avenue Southeast, Andrew Riverside Presbyterian Church site
DATE OF APPLICATION: January 21, 2008
APPLICANTS: Commonbond Communities, Elizabeth Flannery/UrbanWorks Architecture
PUBLICATION DATE: April 30, 2008
DATE OF HEARING: May 6, 2008
END OF APPEAL PERIOD: May 16, 2008
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Fifth Street Southeast Historic District
CATEGORY: non-contributing
CLASSIFICATION: Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a multi-use development
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Molly McCartney, (612) 673-5811

A. BACKGROUND:

This staff report is for final Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) approval for new construction of a multi-use development in the Fifth Street Southeast Historic District. At the March 23, 2008, meeting, the HPC approved the Certificate of Appropriateness, with the condition that final elevation drawing be reviewed by the Commission.

On March 21, 2008, after the publication of the staff report and prior to the March 23, 2008, HPC meeting, the applicant presented an updated elevation rendering of the project to staff, which reflected a condition of approval placed on the staff recommendation approval. At the March 23, 2008, meeting, the HPC decided that a final set of elevation drawings based on that rendering submitted on March 21, 2008 would be required for their final approval. The following approval and conditions requires that the HPC review and approve a final set of elevation drawings for the project in a public hearing.

401 8th Avenue Southeast, Fifth Street Southeast Historic District

Ward 3, Staff: Molly McCartney, 612-673-5811

Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a multi-use development (Andrew Riverside Presbyterian Church site)

Action Taken: Staff findings were **adopted** and a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction was **approved**, subject to the following conditions:

1. That the main projection on the 4th Street Southeast façade terminates with a flat roof, or cornice line, or other feature in keeping with the Gothic Revival detailing found on other portions of the building. Updated elevations to be guided by the rendering dated March 21, 2008;
2. Final drawings including plans, elevations and details shall be reviewed and approved by the HPC;
3. The windows of the building to be metal clad windows; and
4. The exterior lap siding shall have a smooth finish.

B. SITE DESCRIPTION

The property located at 401 8th Avenue Southeast is the former site of Andrews Riverside Presbyterian Church. Designed by architect Charles S. Sedwick as a replica of St. Giles in Edinburgh, Scotland, the church had a limestone-clad, Gothic Revival style edifice, complete with a crenellated tower, turret, and stone finials. Built 1890, with an 1899 addition containing a Sunday school, a grand hall, and a bowling alley, the church was a contributing property to the Fifth Street Southeast Historic District.

On August 11, 2002, a section of the north wall of the 1899 addition collapsed. The church was vacated and the congregation later applied for a COA to demolish the entire structure. On May 21, 2003, the HPC approved the demolition of the 1899 addition, but not the original 1890 church. The congregation subsequently appealed this decision to the city council and was granted approval for the complete demolition of the entire building. The site is now a vacant lot.

The HPC has denied two COAs for new buildings at the subject site. At a public hearing on December 13, 2005, the HPC reviewed a request by the applicant to construct a five-story, 52 ft.-56 ft. tall, L-shaped, mixed use building containing 38 residential units, 4,500 sq. ft. of first floor space for the church and 38 underground parking spaces. After reviewing the staff report and all public testimony, the HPC adopted staff findings and denied the COA. At a public hearing on June 27, 2006, notwithstanding the staff recommendation, the HPC denied a COA for a four-story, 52 ft. tall, L-shaped mixed use building. The proposal included 38 residential units, 5,000 sq. ft. of first floor space for a church and 38 underground parking spaces. At this meeting, the HPC made a motion recommending the Planning Director examine whether or not this site should be removed from the Fifth Street Southeast Historic District. Since the denials, the congregation appeared at the HPC for an informational item on January 30, 2007 to discuss appropriate design and future actions toward the site.

The Fifth Street Southeast Historic District is primarily a residential district, with most of the contributing resources being homes built in the late 19th century. Architectural styles varies, but there are excellent examples of the Italianate Revival, Greek Revival and Richardsonian Romanesque styles. There is a combination of large and small homes built in the district, along with three institutional buildings, Andrew Presbyterian Church (nonextant), the First Congregational Church at 500 8th Avenue SE and the an apartment building at 414 7th Avenue Southeast. These institutional buildings are the least representative resources in the district.

The subject site is located at the perimeter of the historic district and only one property line of the subject site is adjacent to other sites in the district. The adjacent single-family and two-family dwellings to the north are considered contributing structures to the district. These houses are generally two and one-half story structures with driveways from the front. These houses have lap siding, which is a common material in the district as well as stucco and brick.

C. CHANGES & ANALYSIS:

The updated elevations are consistent with the previously submitted elevation (as detailed in the attached March 23, 2008 staff report), with the following changes:

- The first condition of the original staff report required that the terminus of the main projection have a flat roof, cornice, or other feature keeping with the details found on other portions of the building. The new drawings show a low-pitched dormer, or pediment, flanked with

crenellations. The most recent elevation is consistent with the rendering shown to the HPC at the March 23, 2008, meeting.

- In the original submission, the pre-cast masonry terminated at base of the second story. The March 21, 2008 rendering showed the masonry extending to the base of the third story. The most recent elevation is consistent with the rendering approved to the HPC at the March 23, 2008, meeting.
- In the original submission, the window in the main projection along 4th Street South showed triple sets of windows. In the March 21, 2008, rendering, the window pattern was double sets of windows. The most recent elevation is consistent with the rendering approved by the HPC at the March 23, 2008, meeting.

The changes shown in the most recent set of elevations reflects the approval by the HPC at the March 23, 2008, meeting.

D. FINDINGS:

1. 401 8th Avenue Southeast is a non-contributing site in the Fifth Street Southeast Historic District, a locally designated historic district.
2. A contributing building, Andrew Riverside Presbyterian Church, was damaged and demolished in 2003. The City Council approved the demolition of the entire church.
3. The site has received two prior denials for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction.
4. The applicants are proposing a new four-story mixed use structure that will contain 39 dwelling units, 5,400 sq. ft. of first floor space for the church and 33 underground parking spaces.
5. At the March 23, 2008, meeting, the HPC decided that a final set of elevation drawings based on that rendering submitted on March 21, 2008 would be required for their final approval. The following approval and conditions requires that the HPC review and approve a final set of elevation drawings for the project in a public hearing.
6. The first condition of the original staff report required that the terminus of the main projection have a flat roof, cornice, or other feature keeping with the details found on other portions of the building. The new drawings, consistent with the rendering dated March 21, 2008, show a low-pitched dormer, or pediment, flanked with crenellations.
7. In the original submission, the pre-cast masonry terminated at base of the second story. The March 21, 2008 rendering showed the masonry extending to the base of the third story. The recent elevation plans have a consistent masonry pattern with the March 21, 2008 renderings.
8. In the original submission, the window in the main projection along 4th Street South showed triple sets of windows. In the March 21, 2008, rendering, the window pattern was double sets of windows. The recent elevation plans have a consistent window pattern with the March 21, 2008 renderings.
9. The most recent elevations are consistent with required conditions of approval by the HPC from the March 23, 2008, meeting.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends that the HPC adopt staff findings and **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for signage, subject to the following conditions:

1. Final drawings including plans, elevations and details shall be reviewed and approved by CPED-Planning staff.

Attachments:

1. Andrew Riverside Senior Housing Elevation Drawings, April 18, 2008. Pages 5-6.
2. Andrew Riverside Development Rendering, March 21, 2008. Page 7.
3. Historic Photograph of Andrew Riverside Congregational Church. Page 8.
4. Actions from the March 23, 2008 Heritage Preservation Commission meeting. Pages 9-10.
5. Staff report from the March 23, 2008 Heritage Preservation Commission meeting - 401 8th Avenue Southeast, Andrew Riverside Presbyterian Church site. Pages 11-35.